Inaccurate Counting Machines Cannot Determine the Real Election Winners

By Felix P. Muga II, Ph.D.

Senior Fellow, Center for People Empowerment in Governance (CenPEG)
Associate Professor, Mathematics Department, Ateneo de Manila University (ADMU)
Chair, Mathematical Sciences Division, National Research Council of the Philippines (NRCP)

The mock election to demonstrate the accuracy of the SMARTMATIC-provided PCOS Machines was conducted on July 24 and July 25, 2012 at the House of Representative.

Two hundred and thirteen (213) votes out of 8,295 votes that were counted by the PCOS Machine differed from the count conducted by the Manual Audit on each of the candidates of the audited elected positions.

The difference that amounts to **213 votes** resulted in an error rating of **2.56781**% or an accuracy rating of **97.43219**%.

Let us consider the implication of the error rating of the PCOS Machine on some of the results of the May 2010 Congressional elections.

1. In the May 2010 Congressional election in the Lone District of Biliran of Eastern Visayas, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines including the invalid votes was **82,127**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **2,109 votes** for the Congressional election of Biliran Province were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the Congressional District of Biliran had **40,010 votes** and his losing rival had **39,649 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **361 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the Lone District of Biliran since the PCOS Machines miscounted **2,109 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led his rival by only **361 votes**.

- A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of Lone Congressional District of Biliran is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.
- 2. In the May 2010 Congressional election in the 1st District of Makati of the National Capital Region, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines including the invalid votes was 136,177.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **3,497 votes** for the Congressional Election of the 1st District of Makati were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 1st Congressional District of Makati had **42,102 votes** and her closest losing rival had **41,860 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **242 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 1st District of Makati since the PCOS Machines miscounted **3,497 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led her rival by only **242 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of the 1st Congressional District of Makati is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

3. In the May 2010 Congressional election in the 6th District of Manila of the National Capital Region, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines including the invalid votes was **108,154.**

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **2,777votes** for the Congressional Election of the 6th District of Manila were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 6th Congressional District of Manila had **39,985 votes** and the closest losing rival had **38,113 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **1,872 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 6th District of Manila since the PCOS Machines miscounted **2,777 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **1,872 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of the 6th Congressional District of Manila is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

4. In the May 2010 Congressional election in the 1st District of Lanao del Sur of ARMM, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **167,643.**

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **4,305 votes** for the Congressional Election of the 1st District of Lanao del Sur were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 6th Congressional District of Lanao del Sur had **66,765 votes** and the closest losing rival had **65,489 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **1,276 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 1st District of Lanao del Sur since the PCOS Machines miscounted **4,305 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **1,276 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner.

5. In the May 2010 Congressional election in the Lone District of ABRA of CAR, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **119,651**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **3,072 votes** for the Congressional Election of the Lone District of Abra were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the Lone Congressional District of Abra had **46,536 votes** and the closest losing rival had **45,454 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **1,082 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the Lone District of Abra since the PCOS Machines miscounted **3,072 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **1,082 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of the Lone Congressional District of Abra is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

6. In the May2010 Congressional election in the Lone District of MOUNTAIN PROVINCE of CAR, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **74,791**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **1,920 votes** for the Congressional Election of the Lone District of MOUNTAIN PROVINCE were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the Lone Congressional District of MOUNTAIN PROVINCE had **24,724 votes** and the closest losing rival had **23,973 votes.** This means that the winning margin is only **751 votes.**

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the Lone District of MOUNTAIN PROVINCE since the PCOS Machines miscounted **1,920 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **751 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of the Lone Congressional District of MOUNTAIN PROVINCE is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

7. In the May2010 Congressional election in the 2nd District of SURIGAO DEL NORTE of CARAGA, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **172,593**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **4,432 votes** for the Congressional Election of the 2nd District of SURIGAO DEL NORTE were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 2nd District of SURIGAO DEL NORTE had **83,912 votes** and the closest losing rival had **81,207 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **2,705 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 2nd District of SURIGAO DEL NORTE since the PCOS Machines miscounted **4,432 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **2,705 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner.

8. In the May2010 Congressional election in the Lone District of BATANES of CAGAYAN VALLEY, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **8,473**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **218 votes** for the Congressional Election of the Lone District of BATANES were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the Lone District of BATANES had **3,076 votes** and the closest losing rival had **2,988 votes.** This means that the winning margin is only **88 votes.**

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the Lone District of BATANES since the PCOS Machines miscounted **218 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **88 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner.

9. In the May2010 Congressional election in the 2ndDistrict of ISABELA of CAGAYAN VALLEY, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **159,592**.

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **4,098 votes** for the Congressional Election of the 2ndDistrict of ISABELA were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 2ndDistrict of ISABELA had **75,045 votes** and the closest losing rival had **72,207 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **2,838 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 2ndDistrict of ISABELA since the PCOS Machines miscounted **4,098 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by only **2,838 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of 2nd District of ISABELA is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

10. In the May2010 Congressional election in the 1st District of BATAAN of CENTRAL LUZON, the total number of votes counted by the PCOS Machines was **163,094.**

Since the PCOS Machines have an error rating of **2.56781%**, it follows that about **4,188 votes** for the Congressional Election of the 1st District of BATAAN were miscounted by the PCOS Machine.

The winning candidate in the 1st District of BATAAN had **80,400 votes** and the closest losing rival had **76,428 votes**. This means that the winning margin is only **3,972 votes**.

Hence, we could not really determine the real winner in the 1st District of BATAAN since the PCOS Machines miscounted **4,188 votes** and the proclaimed candidate led the rival by **3,972 votes**.

A 100% manual recount must be conducted to determine the real winner. Actually, the result of the election of 1st District of BATAAN is under protest in the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal.

11. The PCOS Counting Error is significant if it is larger than the winning margin. It is negligible if the winning margin is twice as large the PCOS Counting Error.

However, it is still significant if the winning margin is less than twice as large as the PCOS Counting Error.

For example, if the Candidate A has 100 votes and Candidate B has 95 votes. If the PCOS miscounts 3 votes, then it is possible that the actual votes of Candidate A is 100 - 3 = 97 votes and that of Candidate B is 95 + 3 = 98 votes.

The following table lists the Congressional elections where the PCOS MISCOUNT is still significant.

	PROVINCE/CITY	DISTRICT	REGION	PCOS MISCOUNT	WINNING MARGIN
11	BATANGAS	3RD	IV-A	6,845	6,863
12	MARINDUQUE	LONE	IV-B	2,671	4,107

13	PALAWAN	2ND	IV-B	5,665	2,811
14	CAMARINES NORTE	2ND	V	2,626	3,881
15	CAMARINES SUR	5TH	V	1,228	1,032
16	SORSOGON	2ND	V	4,086	1,165
17	ILOILO	5TH	VI	4,500	8,586
18	EASTERN SAMAR	LONE	VIII	5,488	7,860
19	NORTHERN SAMAR	2ND	VIII	3,182	2,958
20	ZAMBOANGA DEL NORTE	2ND	IX	4,459	4,760
21	ZAMBOANGA SIBUGAY	2ND	IX	3,545	2,416
22	CAGAYAN DE ORO CITY	1ST	Х	4,482	1,780
23	MISAMIS OCCIDENTAL	2ND	Х	3,624	991
24	DAVAO CITY	1ST	ΧI	5,714	8,172
25	NORTH COTABATO	1ST	XIII	6,127	6,677

1. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE LONE DISTRICT OF BILIRAN, EASTERN VISAYAS

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Nacionalista	Rogelio Espina	40,010	50,10%
Lakas-Kampi	Glenn Chong	39,649	49.65%
Independent	Paul Diu	203	0.25%
	Valid votes	79,862	97.24%
	Invalid or blank votes	2,265	2.76%
	Totals	82,127	100.00%

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Eastern Vi sayas, 2010

2. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE 1st DISTRICT OF MAKATI, NATIONAL CAPITAL REGION

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
PDP-Laban	Monique Lagdameo	42,102	33.52%
Liberal	Maria Lourdes Locsin	41,860	33.32%
Independent	Robert Dean Barbers	25,990	20.69%
Bigkis Pinoy	Oscar Ibay	14,993	11.94%
KBL	Oswaldo Carbonell	668	0.53%
	Valid votes	125,613	92.24%
	Invalid or blank votes	10,564	7.76%
	Totals	136,177	100.00%

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine_House_of_Representatives_elections_in_Metro_Manila, 2010

3. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE $6^{\rm th}$ DISTRICT OF MANILA, NATIONAL CAPITAL REGION

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Sandy Ocampo	39,985	38.63%
Lakas-Kampi	Benny M. Abante	38,113	36.82%
Nacionalista	Danilo Lacuna	24,866	24.03%
Independent	Ramon Villanueva	204	0.20%
Independent	Joven Yuson	160	0.16%
PGRP	Marlo Gerardo Artacho	96	0.09%
Bigkis Pinoy	Ronaldo Tibig	76	0.07%
	Valid votes	103,500	95.70%
	Invalid or blank votes	4,654	4.30%
	Totals	108,154	100.009

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Metro Manila, 2010

4. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE 1st DISTRICT OF LANAO DEL SUR, ARMM

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Mohammed Hussein Pacasum Pangandaman	66,765	39.83%
Nacionalista	Salic Dumarpa	65,489	39.06%
Independent	Princess Johyra Pangarungan	26,546	15.83%
PMP	Salic Mundir	4,495	2.68%
Independent	Abul Khayr Alonto	4,351	2.60%
	Totals	167,643	100.00%

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in the Auton omous_Region_in_Muslim_Mindanao,_2010

5. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE LONE DISTRICT OF ABRA, CAR

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
PDSP	Joy Bernos-Valera	46,536	40.85%
Lakas-Kampi	Cecilia Seares-Luna	45,454	39.90%
Nacionalista	Ma. Zita Valera	11,249	9.87%
PMP	Mailed Molina	10,677	9.37%
	Valid votes	113,916	95.21%
	Invalid or blank votes	5,735	4.79%
	Totals	119,651	100.00%

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cordillera Administrative Region

6. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE LONE DISTRICT OF MOUNTAIN PROVINCE, CAR

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Maximo Dalog	24,724	33.71%
Independent	Jupiter Dominguez	23,973	32.68%
Aksyon	Franklin Odsey	18,792	25.62%
Independent	Thomas Perry Killip	5,865	8.00%
	Valid votes	73,354	98.08%
	Invalid or blank votes	1,437	1.92%
	Totals	74,791	100.00%

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cordillera Administrative Region

7. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE 2nd DISTRICT OF SURIGAO DEL NORTE, CARAGA

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Guillermo Romarate, Jr.	83,912	50.82%
Nacionalista	Alfonso Cassura	81,207	49.18%
	Valid votes	165,119	95.67%
	Invalid or blank votes	7,474	4.33%
	Totals	172,593	100.00%

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Caraga, 20 10

8. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE LONE DISTRICT OF BATANES, CAGAYAN VALLEY

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Dina Abad	3,076	37.07%
Lakas-Kampi	Carlo Oliver Diasnes	2,988	36.01%
Independent	Alex Narag	2,234	26.92%
	Valid votes	8,298	97.93%
	Invalid or blank votes	175	2.07%
	Totals	8,473	100.00%

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Cagayan Valley, 2010

9. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE 2ND DISTRICT OF ISABELA, CAGAYAN VALLEY

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Nacionalista <u> </u>	Ana Cristina Go	75,045	50.96%
Bigkis Pinoy	Edgar Uy	72,207	49.04%
	Valid votes	147,252	92.27%
	Invalid or blank votes	12,340	7.73%
	Totals	159,592	100.00%

SOURCE:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Cagayan Valley, 2010

10. RESULT OF THE MAY 2010 CONGRESSIONAL ELECTION IN THE $\mathbf{1}^{\text{st}}$ DISTRICT OF BATAAN , CENTRAL LUZON

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Herminia Roman	80,400	51.27%
Independent	Maria Angela Garcia	76,428	48.73%
	Valid votes	156,828	96.16%
	Invalid or blank votes	6,266	3.84%
	Totals	163,094	100.00%

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Philippine House of Representatives elections in Central Luzo n, 2010

11. The following tables have significant PCOS Counting Error.

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
PMP	Nelson Collantes	67,238	27.19%
Liberal	Cristeta Reyes	60,375	24.42%
NPC	Ma. Chona Dimayuga	52,387	21.19%
Nacionalista	Luis Carlos Laurel	36,023	14.57%
Lakas-Kampi	Rodrigo Reyes	22,457	9.08%
Lapiang Manggagawa	Nicomedes Hernandez	8,790	3.55%
	Valid votes	247,270	92.76%
	Invalid or blank votes	19,288	7.24%
	Totals	266,558	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
_akas-Kampi	Lord Allan Jay Q. Velasco	52,407	52.04%
Liberal	Edmundo O. Reyes	48,300	47.96%
	Valid votes	100,707	96.82%
	Invalid or blank votes	3.306	3.18%
	Totals	104,013	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
NPC	Victorino Socrates	93,916	47.23%
Lakas-Kampi	Mario Joel Reyes	91,105	45.81%
Independent	Rodolfo Socrates	12,179	6.12%
Independent	Christopher Morales	1,661	0.84%
	Valid votes	198,861	90.14%
	Invalid or blank votes	21,761	9.86%
	Totals	220,622	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Elmer Panotes	51,704	50.56%
Liberal	Liwayway Vinzons-Chato	47,823	46.77%
Independent	Donald Asis	3,734	3.65%
	Totals	102,261	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Nacionalista	Salvio Fortuno	76,659	42.21%
Lakas-Kampi	Emmanuel Alfelor	75,627	41.64%
Liberal	Jesus Jay Dimaiwat	13,477	7.42%
PDP-Laban	Mariano Trinidad	956	0.52%
	Valid votes	166,719	91.79%
	Invalid or blank votes	14,907	8.21%
	Totals	181,626	100.00%

2) (7 N) 5

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Deogracias Ramos	30,945	19.45%
NPC	Ricardo Golpeo	29,780	18.72%
Nacionalista	Juan Guysayko	28,852	18.13%
PDP-Laban	Arze Glipo	14,838	9.32%
Lakas-Kampi	Flocerfida de Guzman	13,822	8.69%
ndependent	Sappho Gillego Ong	12,142	7.63%
ndependent	Cyril Ramos	10,501	6.60%
PMP	Edmundo Escalante	1,168	0.73%
ndependent	Rosario Gavanzo	629	0.40%
	Valid votes	142,677	89.67%
	Invalid or blank votes	16,441	10.33%
	Totals	159,118	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Neil Tupas, Jr.	87,455	52.41%
Nacionalista	Rolex Suplico	78,869	47.27%
NPC	Raul Alba	541	0.32%
	Valid votes	166,856	92.87%
	Invalid or blank votes	8,388	4.79%
	Totals	175,253	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Independent	Ben P. Evardone	74,082	38.07%
Independent	Teodulo Coquilla	66,222	34.03%
NPC	Raymond Apita	25,932	13.33%
PMP	Mateo Biong, Jr.	17,682	9.09%
Nacionalista	Maximo Aljibe	9,108	4.68%
Independent	Conrado Macasa, Sr.	806	0.41%
Independent	Angelo Miguel	577	0.30%
PGRP	Febidal Padel	193	0.10%
	Valid votes	194,602	91.05%
	Invalid or blank votes	19,137	8.95%
	Totals	213,739	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Emil Ong	56,791	51.34%
Liberal	Antonio Lucero	53,833	48.66%
	Valid votes	110,624	89.27%
	Invalid or blank votes	13,296	10.73%
	Totals	123,920	100,00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Rosendo Labadlabad	82,686	50.80%
Lakas-Kampi	Ronald Yebes	77,926	47.88%
Independent	Julito Feras	1,739	1.07%
Independent	Nurolhadi Mendoza	417	0.26%
	Valid votes	162,768	93.73%
	Invalid or blank votes	10,879	6.27%
	Totals	173,647	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Nacionalista	Romeo Jalosjos, Jr.	65,909	50.53%
Lakas-Kampi	George Hofer II	63,493	48.68%
Independent	Moises Abellano, Sr.	595	0.46%
Liberal	Noe Barbadillo	445	0.34%
	Valid votes	130,442	94.48%
	Invalid or blank votes	7,627	5.52%
	Totals	138,069	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
PMP	Jose Benjamin Benaldo	31,652	34.66%
Lakas-Kampi	Rainier Joaquin Uy	29,872	32.72%
Independent	Lourdes Darimbang	26,298	28.80%
Independent	Tito Dichosa	2,134	2.34%
Liberal	Dulcesimo Ytem	1,353	1.48%
	Valid votes	91,309	93.41%
	Invalid or blank votes	6,438	6.59%
	Totals	174,538	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Liberal	Loreto Leo Ocampos	50,131	37.60%
Lakas-Kampi	Reynaldo Parojinog, Sr	49,140	36.86%
NPC	Jennifer Tan	33,481	25.11%
Independent	Alfredo Paglinawan	576	0.43%
Valid votes		133,328	94.46%
	Invalid or blank votes	7,818	5.5%
	Totals	141,146	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Karlo Alexei Nograles	99,586	47.64%
Liberal	Maria Belen Acosta	91,414	43.74%
Independent	Jocelyn Duterte	11,859	5.67%
Independent	Robert Elnar Olanolan	5,345	2.56%
Independent	Juan R. Zamora	347	0.17%
Independent	Bernard Custodio	266	0.13%
Independent	Anacleto Millendez	200	0.10%
Valid votes		209,017	93.93%
Invalid or blank votes		13,503	6.07%
	Totals	222,520	100.00%

Party	Candidate	Votes	Percentage
Lakas-Kampi	Nancy Catamco	119,294	50.00%
Liberal	Bernardo Piñol, Jr.	112,617	47.20%
	Valid votes	231,911	97.20%
	Invalid or blank votes	6,691	2.80%
	Totals	238,602	100.00%